Notes

Introduction

4. Ibid., 239.
5. A noteworthy exception is Pope John Paul II, who writes that as his mother died when he was nine, “I do not have a clear awareness of her contribution, which must have been great, to my religious training” *(Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordination* [New York: Doubleday, 1996], 20). Instead the Pope was influenced by his father, “a deeply religious man. Day after day I was able to observe the austere way in which he lived. By profession he was a soldier and, after my mother’s death, his life became one of constant prayer . . . his example was in a way my first seminary, a kind of domestic seminary” (ibid., 20).

1 Armies of Women


11. Ibid., 42.

12. Ibid., 43.

13. Ibid., 89.


27. For some other members of Uranian circles who were attracted to varieties of Catholicism see Hilliard, “UnEnglish and Unmanly,” 197-199. His inclusion of Msgr. Robert Hugh Benson is probably unwarranted, although the Benson family was very odd. Benson’s brother wrote novels which have become popular in modern homosexual circles, but the most famous, *David Blaize*, is a sympathetic celebration of attractive qualities (physical, emotional, and spiritual) in boys and young men. Although it mentions schoolboy homosexual experimentation, it does not hold it up as an ideal.


30. William Oddie, “My Time at Homoerotic College,” *The Spectator*, 277 (7 December 1996): 21. Oddie says that when he was at St. Stephen’s House at Oxford, he “estimated that fully two-thirds were openly homosexual” (20) as Anglo-Catholics especially tended to be homosexual. At St. Stephen’s men were given women’s names (21) (a custom at some Catholic seminaries in North America) and is now “a hotbed of radical feminism” (21). Cuddeson, still too peculiar, also had a reputation for homosexuality. Oddie sadly concurs that “in the Church of England sodomy is on the verge of becoming part of that Church’s semi-official culture” (20). There are few men in the pews of Anglican churches.

32. Ibid., 152.
35. Ibid., 201.
36. Ibid., 204.

37. Testosterone can fluctuate with emotions. Being successful raises testosterone levels in both men and women. Rosalind Miles notes in passing that “Dr James Dabbs of Georgia State University told the American Association for the Advancement of Science Annual Congress in 1989 that a survey of men in different professions showed that vicars displayed the lowest levels of testosterone, while ‘actors and American football players’ had the highest” (*The Rites of Man: Love, Sex and Death in the Making of the Male* [London: Grafton Books, 1991], 212). Perhaps men with low testosterone are attracted to being vicars; more probably the discouraging nature of the work and the low status they have among men produces the emotional state which in turn brings about low testosterone levels.
38. Terman and Miles, *Sex and Personality*, 220.
39. Ibid.
40. Ibid, 153.
41. Ibid, 9: “Most emphatic warning is necessary against the assumption that an extremely feminine score for males or an extremely masculine score for females can serve as an adequate basis for the diagnosis of homosexuality, whether overt or latent.”
54. Argyle and Beit-Hallahmi, *Social Psychology*, 75. Jews were not included in one census, but evidence indicates that men are more observant than women. Argyle, *Religious Behavior*, 77.

- 51 percent of men and 63 percent of women say that religion is not outdated and can answer all or most of today’s problems.
- 58 percent of men and 69 percent of women say they have a ‘great deal’ or ‘quite a lot’ of confidence in the church as an institution.
- 51 percent of men and 69 percent of women say prayer is ‘very important’ to them.
- 33 percent of men and 45 percent of women say reading the Bible is ‘very important.’
- 38 percent of men and 47 percent of women say attending church is ‘very important.’
- 38 percent of men and 55 percent of women say that receive a ‘great deal’ of comfort and support from their religious beliefs.

64. George Barna, *Index*, 87. Barna’s silent inclusion of women’s greater interest in horoscopes shows that women’s religiosity is free-floating, and might alight on something other than Christianity.
65. Peter L. Benson and Carolyn H. Eklin, *Effective Christian Education: A National Study of Protestant Congregations. A Summary Report on Faith, Loyalty, and Congregational Life* (Minneapolis, Mn.: Search Institute, 1990), 17. In the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ) 41 percent of the males and 35 percent of the females; in the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, 58 percent of the males and 48 percent of the females, in the Presbyterian Church USA 44 percent of the males and 34 percent of the females, in the United Church of Christ 48 percent of the males and 33 percent of the females, in the United Methodist Church 43 percent of the males and 28 percent of the females, but in the Southern Baptist Convention 23 percent of the males and 23 percent of the females.
66. Ibid.
69. David O. Moberg, *The Church as a Social Institution: The Sociology of American Religion* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1962), 397. This may be so because rural areas still have a stronger ideology of masculinity, which finds expression in farming and hunting, than urban areas, and as we shall see, masculinity and religiousness (at least of the Christian variety) do not get along well in our culture.


71. Ibid.


73. Ibid., 42.

74. Ibid., 43.


79. Ibid., x. In fact the situation was worse for Catholics. The 1902 *New York Times* survey showed that 72.8 percent of Manhattan adults attending church services were women (McLeod, *Piety and Poverty*, 169). Some admit the gravity of the situation: *The Catholic Telegraph* once said that at the same communion rail there are everywhere ten young women for every one young man” (Carl Delos Case, *The Masculine in Religion* [Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1906], 23).

80. Ibid.


83. Ibid., 391.

84. Ibid., 389.

85. Ibid., 391.


89. Quoted, ibid.
95. Ownby writes: “Records of twenty-seven evangelical churches reveal that between 1868 and 1906 women constituted about 62 percent of the churches’ members” (Ibid., 129).
99. Paul E. Johnson, “Women formed majorities of the membership of every church at every point in time. But in every church, men increased their proportion of the communicants during revivals, indicating that revivals were family experiences and that women were converting the men” *(A Shopkeeper’s Millennium: Society and Revivals in Rochester, New York 1815-1837* [New York, Hill and Wang, 1978], 108). Mary E. Ryan says that “the proportion of females in the revivals was in excess of their presence in the population of the worship, it was slightly lower than their proportion of overall church membership. The preponderance of women also varied slightly over time, tending to decline in the middle of the revival cycle” *(Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County, New York, 1790-1865* [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981], 80).
104. Ibid., 48.
105. Ibid., 49.
106. Ibid., 59.
108. Herbert Moller says: “While in New England immigration males outnum-
bered females three to two, the ratio was six to one in the Virginia immigration” (“Sex Composition and Correlated Culture Patterns of Colonial America,” William and Mary Quarterly, 3rd series, 2 [1945]: 118).

109. Gerald F. Moran and Maris A. Vinovskis, Religion, Family, and the Life Course: Explorations in the Social History of Early America (Ann Arbor; University of Michigan Press, 1992), 66. Moran and Vinovskis show that over the course of the seventeenth century, church membership became more and more feminized; see Religion, 67, 85-90. They explain it as the result of the use of bridal metaphors in preaching (Religion, 98-99). By the onset of the Revolution, “the median percentage of women at admission had reached 65” (Religion, 101). Robert G. Pope notes the early decline of religious commitment among men: “The percentage of men among the new communicants is revealing: in 1632-1649 they represented 43 percent of the increment; in 1650-1669 this figure dropped to 35 percent; and in 1670-1689, to 33 percent. The same pattern holds for owning the covenant. By the final decade three out of every four half-way covenant members were women” (The Half-Way Covenant: Church Membership in Puritan New England [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969], 217-218). This is even more striking since over half the population was male.


112. Douglas Davies et al, Church and Religion in Rural England (Edinburgh: T and T Clark, 1991), 245-246. The others show low medium or medium religious commitment. Men showed a far lesser belief in life after death (30 percent) than did women (53 percent) (Davies, Church and Religion, 253). Or, for the more statistically minded, 27 percent of males showed low religious commitment, 29 percent medium high or high religious commitment, as compared to 18 percent low and 43 percent medium-high or high religious commitment among working females and 15 percent low and 48 percent medium-high or high religious commitment among non-working females. See David Gerard, “Religious Attitudes and Values” in Values and Social Change in Britain (London: Macmillan, 1985), ed. Mark Abrams, David Gerard and Noel Timms, 70-71.

113. Davie, Religion in Britain, 118.


115. Davie, Religion in Britain, 118.

116. Ibid., 119.

117. Ibid., 119-20.


84 percent of women believe in God, but only 67 percent of men;
9 percent of women say they do not believe in God, but nearly twice as many
men (16 percent) say the same.
72 percent of women believe in sin and 66 percent of men
27 percent of men do not believe in sin and 21 percent of women
76 percent of women believe in the soul and 58 percent of men
14 percent of women do not believe in the soul, but 30 percent of men
69 percent of women believe in heaven and 50 percent of men
22 percent of women do not believe in heaven to 40 percent of men
57 percent of women believe in life after death and 39 percent of men
25 percent of women do not believe in life after death, to 45 percent of men
42 percent of women believe in the devil, to 32 percent of men
50 percent of women do not believe in the devil and 60 percent of men
35 percent of women believe in hell and 37 percent of men
55 percent of women do not believe in hell to 64 percent of men.”

119. Ibid, 84.
120. Ibid, 76.
121. Ibid, 72.
122. Ibid, 73.
123. Ibid.
124. Gillian Rose, quoted in McLeod, Piety and Poverty, 151.
125. Richard Mudie-Smith, The Religious Life of London (London: Hodder and
Saughton, 1904), 302. For the morning services 59,058 men and 82,975 women; for
the evening services, 73,440 men and 132,232 women. There were major differences
in denominations. The Church of England was the most feminized. For the morn-
ing services in London there were 46,343 men and 84,602 women, for the evening
services 48,396 men and 96,680 women, almost a two to one ratio. For the larger Protestant
denominations, the least feminized was the Salvation Army. It had 2,275 men and
2,138 women at the morning services, 4,411 men and 6,668 women at the evening
services. The Roman Catholics in London had 18,784 men and 32,884 women at morn-
ing services, and 5,071 men and 9,890 women at evening services. The proportion of men
among Roman Catholics was closer to that in the Church of England than that in the
slightly less feminized, smaller Protestant denominations (442-46). Synagogues, by
contrast, had 15,157 men and 4,375 women (263).
126. See “Women and Anglo-Catholicism” in Reed, Glorious Battle, 187-209.
127. S. A. Walker, quoted by John Shelton Reed, “A Female Movement: The Femi-
nization of Nineteenth-Century Anglo-Catholicism,” Anglican and Episcopal History, 57
129. Reed, “A Female Movement,” 204.
130. John Angell James, Female Piety (Pittsburgh: Soli Deo Gloria Publications,
1994), 262.
131. Quoted by Patrick Collinson, Godly People: Essays on English Protestantism
132. Elisabeth Schneider-Böcklen and Dorothea Vorländer, “Die großen Kirchen—zumindest im Bereich der Bundesrepublik Deutschland — sind mit 80% Frauenanteil an der Zahl ihrer Mitarbeiter regelrecht, ‘Frauenbetriebe.’” (Feminismus und Glaube [Mainz: Matthia-Grünewald-Verlag, 1991], 15). The situation has been of long standing. In the Protestant churches of Berlin, “a survey of attendance at morning services in 1913 showed that women also made up about two-thirds of the congregations counted—though women may have made up a higher proportion of the total churchgoing population, as there are some indications that (as in London) evening congregations were more strongly female than those in the morning” (McLeod, Piety and Poverty, 163).


134. In the basic Christian communities of São Paolo, 56.5 per cent of the middle-class membership and 66.2 percent of the lower-class membership is female (W. E. Hewitt, “Basic Christian Communities of the Middle-Classes in the Archdiocese of São Paolo” Sociological Analysis 48 [1987]: 160).


136. Ibid., 5.


138. Ibid., 295.


140. Christian, Person and God, 134.

141. Lison-Tolosana, Belmonte, 309.

142. Ibid., 338.


144. Ibid., 130.


146. Fernand Boulard writes: “Le comportement des sexes, très contrasté dans les périodes anciennes, évolue nettement vers un rapprochement des taux. Le recensement dominical qui a couvert le diocèse de Versailles le 23 novembre 1975, a fait apparaître que le taux de masculinité (proportion d’hommes dans l’assemblée des pratiquants) s’est abaisssé presque partout entre 35 et 40% pour les plus de 25 ans; un peu plus faible dans les doyennés ruraux, il atteignait même 50%, soit la parité absolue de la pratique des sexes, en quelques doyennés urbains. Or, en 1907-1908, dans l’arrondissement de Versailles, ce taux était de 15.6% et vers 1880, moyenne de l’ensemble du diocèse, il n’atteignait pas 11%” (The behavior of the sexes, very different during former periods, has distinctly changed in the direction of a similarity of rates. The Sunday census which covered the diocese of Versailles on November 23, 1975 made it
clear that the rate of masculinity [the proportion of men in the assembly of practicing Catholics] has stabilized almost everywhere between 35 and 40% for those more than 25 years old; a little more weak among rural senior citizens, it attains an absolute part of 50% among some urban senior citizens. In contrast, in 1907-1908 in the neighborhood of Versailles, the rate was 15.6% and around 1880 for the whole diocese it did not reach 11% (Matériaux pour l’histoire religieuse du peuple français XIXe-XXe siècles [Paris: Editions de L’Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, 1982], 19. However, the statistics in this book reveal a longstanding and massive difference in religious practice between French men and women.

148. Ibid., 254.
149. Ibid., 180. “On remarquera l’abondance des pascalisants et le dimorphisme des sexes.”
150. Ibid., 165.
153. The current situation in the Catholic Church, in which contraception is officially condemned but those who adhere to this doctrine are largely excluded from Catholic education and diocesan structures, may be due to the same strategy of not offending women.
156. Ibid., 63.
158. Ibid.
2 Can a Man Be a Christian?

4. Ibid.
9. Ibid., 112.
11. Trollope, Domestic Manners, 102.
12. Cotton Mather, Ornaments for the Daughter of Sion (Boston, 1648), 45.
14. Freud was working toward a distinction of physical sexuality and cultural gender identity, and there seems to be a consistent theory underlying his various observations. Judith van Herik has collected all the relevant passages from Freud and analyzed their significance for a theory of gender in Freud on Femininity and Faith (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982).
16. Ibid., 150.
19. Ibid., 75.
21. Ibid., p. 98.

Notes to Pages 26–32

161. Kosmin and Lachman, One Nation Under God, 220.
22. Ibid., p. 88.
27. For a compendium of outrageous things that Catholics have said about Mary see Hilda Graef, *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion* (Westminster, Maryland: Christian Classics, 1985).
31. Ibid., 129.
32. Ibid.
40. Von Balthasar sees the lack of men, which I think is in part a result of the Aristotelian theory he accepts, as a confirmation of his theory: “We should therefore not be surprised, but rather feel how fitting it is, that normally far more women than men participate in the celebration of the Church’s Eucharistic banquet” (“Thoughts on the Priesthood of Women,” *Communio* 23 [1996]: 707).
43. Ibid., 55-56.
3 What Is Masculinity?

1. J. M. Tanner, Foetus into Man: Physical Growth from Conception to Maturity (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1978), 56. R. J. Stoller elaborates: “The biologic rules governing sexual behavior in mammals are simple. In all, including man, the ‘resting’ state of tissue is female. We can now demonstrate without exception, in all experiments performed on animals, that if androgens in the proper amount and biochemical form are withheld during critical periods in fetal life, anatomy and behavior typical of that species’ males do not occur, regardless of genetic sex. And if androgens in the proper amount and form are introduced during crucial periods in fetal life, anatomy and behavior typical of that species’ males do occur, regardless of genetic sex” (Presentations of Gender [New Haven: Yale University Press, 1985], 74).


4. Elisabeth Badinter writes: “this very erotic relationship teaches the infant the nirvana of passive dependence and will leave indelible marks on the adult’s psyche. But the consequences of this experience are not the same for the boy and girl. For the girl, it is the basis of identification with her own sex, whereas for the boy it is an inversion of later roles. To become a man, he will have to learn to differentiate himself from his mother and repress, within the deepest part of himself, that delicious passivity in which he was entirely and exclusively one with her. The erotic bond between mother and child is not limited to oral satisfactions. It is she who, by the care she gives him, awakens all his sensuality, initiates him to pleasure, and teaches him to love his body” (XY: On Masculine Identity, trans. Lydia Davis, [New York: Columbia University Press, 1995], 44-45).


7. Fast claims that there is “a pattern of femininity found in men who have not successfully resolved issues of gender differentiation” (Gender Identity, 69). This unre-
solved conflict can result in a variety of disorders: extreme misogyny, because the female represents the infantile in the man, (Ibid., 69), sado-masochism, which is found far more frequently in males than females (Ibid., 70), and perhaps erotic disorders which cause the man to follow the mothers erotic gaze to a man (passive homosexuality) or to a boy (pedophilia). It is a sensitive subject, but the source of pedophilia among the clergy may be the same failure to achieve full differentiation from the feminine, a failure that causes some of them also to be attracted to religion, because they see it as a feminine activity. See also Ralph R. Greenson, “Dis-Identifying from Mother: Its Special Importance for the Boy,” International Journal of Psycho-analysis 49 (1968): 370-374.

8. Margaret Mead noted “The boy learns that he must make an effort to enter the world of men, that this first act of differentiating himself from his mother, of realizing his own body as his and different from hers, must be continued in long years of effort—which may not succeed” (Male and Female: A Study of the Sexes in a Changing World [1944. Westport Connecticut: Greenwood Press, 1977], 151).

9. Ronald R Levant says: “At an early age, then, boys are given the prize of a sense of themselves as separate individuals; in return, they are required to give up their close attachment to their mothers. Hence, as boys grow up, yearnings for maternal closeness and attachment (which never completely go away) become associated with the fear of losing themselves as separate. When such yearnings for maternal closeness begin to emerge into awareness, they often bring with them terrible images of the loss of the sense of identity” (“Toward a Reconstruction of Masculinity” in A New Psychology of Men [NY: Basic Books, 1995], 244). See Karen Horney,” The Dread of Women,” International Journal of Psycho-Analysis (3) 1932, 348-360.


11. Ibid., 49.


13. Ibid., 15.

14. Ibid.

15. Bakan writes: “The separated being is destined to die. The only way in which there can be any biological continuity is through the act of sexual intercourse, resulting in the birth of another separate (Duality, 51).

16. Ibid., 40.

17. Ibid., 141.


21. Ibid., 57. Peter N. Stearns says “One does not just become a man. A natural
passage of sexual maturation is not enough. In most societies, including our own, boys require a more extensive, arduous transition to manhood (“Be A Man! Males in Modern Society” [New York: Holmes and Meier, 1990], 16).

24. Ibid., 230.
25. Ibid., 229.
29. Ibid., 5.
31. As Nicholas Davidson points out: “If toil and suffering have been women’s lot, then have also been men’s. It is no accident that women live longer than men, even in cultures that are said to oppress women (and may actually do so in some cases). Men have faced agony on blood-soaked battlefields, been worked to death in mines and on galley ships, and in all cultures die younger than women” (*The Failure of Feminism* [Buffalo: Prometheus Books, 1988], 50).
32. Goldberg, *Hazards*, 87
34. Ibid., 18.
36. Ibid., 11.
37. Ibid., 15
40. Van Gennep, *Rites*, 75.
41. Ibid., 72.
42. Bruno Bettelheim notes “some features of male initiation rites apparently are
designed to make men as much as possible like women” (*Symbolic Wounds: Puberty Rites and the Envious Male* [London: Thames and Hudson, 1955], 107).

43. Gilbert A. Herdt reports that one boy, Kambo, feared that he was developing a birth canal because of his homosexual activities, which were supposed to help him turn into a man: “That fantasy, a free floating anxiety that semen ingestion might effect female traits in a boy, is a prevalent response among young novices” (*Guardians of the Flutes: Idioms of Masculinity* [New York: McGraw Hill Book Company, 1981], 281).


46. Ibid.


48. Bettelheim notes “among some groups of young men hurtful scarification was as important a part of adolescent ritual as it is in initiation. German students were more than willing to suffer cutting and bloodletting, proudly considering their the dueling ordeal as a demonstration of their manliness and their worthiness to belong to the group” (*Symbolic Wounds*, 99).

49. Turner, “Betwixt and Between,” II.


51. Ibid.

52. Ibid., 76.

53. Initiation is much more common among men. Bettelheim says “Nearly all students of initiation in preliterate society express the notion that initiation of girls is secondary to that of boys” (*Symbolic Wounds*, 246). That this should be so follows from the difference in development and relation to the mother that boys and girls experience, and to the fact that masculinity is an ideology that must be inculcated in boys.


57. Willoughby writes “Mithra himself had been for long centuries the god of battles, and his cult was an exclusively masculine one” (*Pagan Regeneration*, 152).


60. Mircea Eliade, writes “For it is a fact that even Christianity, a revealed religion which did not originally imply any secret rite, which had proclaimed and propa-
gated itself in the broad light of day and for all men, came in the end to borrow from the
liturgies and the vocabulary of the Hellenistic mysteries” (Rites, 121).

61. Mircea Eliade observes, “Le nombre de livres et études analysant les scénarios
initiatiques camouflés dans les poèmes, les nouvelles et les romans, est considérable”
(“L’initiation et le monde moderne” (The number of books and studies analyzing the serious
of initiation hidden in poems, short stories, and novels, is considerable), Initiation: Contri-
butions to the theme of the Study-Conference of the International Association for the History
of Religions Held at Strasbourg, September 17th to 22nd, 1964, ed. C. J. Bleeker [Leiden: J.
Brill, 1965], 12).

62. Frank S. Pittman 111: “Before he is permitted to achieve victory, the hero must
renounce his boyish selfishness, his fear of death and of humiliation, and even his desire for
truth; he must be willing to give up his life for others” (Man Enough: Fathers, Sons and the

63. See Robert Randall, “Return of the Pleiades,” Natural History 96 (June 1987): 43-
52.

64. See Hope Nash Wolff, A Study in the Narrative Structure of Three Epic Poems:

65. The Odyssey of Homer, trans. Richard Lattimore (1965; New York: Perennial

1967) 9.

67. Ibid.

68. Gilmore, Manhood in the Making, 39.

Critical Essays, ed. George Steiner and Robert Fagles (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice,
1962) 111.

70. Gilmore, Manhood, 38.

71. Wolff, Study, 57.

72. Ibid.

73. Dimock, “The Name of Odysseus,” 53. But Odysseus is also the one who
suffers much.

74. Wolff, Study, 57

75. Ibid.

76. As Catherine Callen King notes, “Homer wants us to see Achilles as having
somehow having crossed the bounds of human nature. One such indication is the pat-
ttern of fire imagery, which, beginning with the divinely kindled fire that blazes from
his head at the trench and continuing through the evening star that marks the end
of his duel with Hektor, contributes to our seeing Achilles as an increasingly deadly el-
mental force. Another indication is the series of lion similes, which suggests that Achil-
les’ deadly force is not only elemental but bestial as well” (Achilles: Paradigms of the
War Hero from Homer to the Middle Ages [Berkeley: University of California Press,
1987], 17-18).


4 God and Man in Judaism: Fathers and the Father-God

3. See Sapp, Sexuality, II.
4. Francis Martin notes that “while the Hebrew verb system distinguishes between masculine and feminine subjects, there is not one verb form in the Old Testament to be found in the feminine form when God is the subject” (The Feminist Question: Feminist Theology in the Light of Christian Tradition [Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1994], 234).
8. Ibid., 12.
13. Ibid.
14. Ibid., 43.
15. Ibid., 44-51.
16. Perhaps there are psychological elements in the story. A father may also develop a Laertes complex, and be jealous of the child as the one who will replace him in the normal course of human life, reproduction, and death.
17. Whether the Psalms were written by the historical David or a literary construct “David” is unimportant in this context.
5 God and Man in Early Christianity: Sons in the Son

1. “According to the Philosopher, a thing is denominated chiefly by its perfection, and by its end. Now generation signified something in the process of being made, whereas paternity signifies that something is something completed; and therefore the name Father is more expressive as regards the divine person than genitor or begetter” (Summa Theologica, Q. 33, Art. 2, ad 2. in Basic Writings of Saint Thomas Aquinas, vol. 1, ed. Anton C. Pegis [New York: Random House, 1945], 326).

2. The central importance of the image of the Church as Bride is the subject of Claude Chevasse’s The Bride of Christ: An Inquiry into the Nuptial Element in Early Christianity (London, Faber and Faber, 1940).

3. As William Oddie observes, “this balance of love, obedience, obligation, and sacrifice has not, within Christian civilization, always been observed. What is perhaps more striking, however, is how unquestioned in practice its acceptance has often been” (What Will Happen to God, Feminism and the Reconstruction of Christian Belief [San Francisco: Ignatius, 1988], 55). Oddie cites the behavior of the men on the Titanic. A group of Washington media people began jokingly visiting the almost-forgotten Washington memorial to these men on the Titanic. What began as a joke became a serious ritual and a tribute to the “courage and sacrifice and grace under pressure” of these men (Ken Ringle, “First Class Tribute: A Night of Remembrance for Titanic’s Gentlemen,” Washington Post, April 16, 1996). As Oddie says, “the sinking of the Titanic remains as a kind of modern icon of the assertion of sacrificial and Christ-like male authority” (Ibid., 55).


6. Ibid., 230.

7. Boff rightly claims that this association of Mary, the Church, and the Spirit is widespread among Catholic theologians. For citation see n. 34 (Boff, The Maternal Face of God, 266) and n. 54 (Boff, The Maternal Face of God, 267). See also Hauke, Women in the Priesthood? 277-296 and 316-317.


13. Ibid., 28.
14. Ibid., 35.
16. Ibid., 287.
18. George T. Montague says “even the category ‘metaphor’ is inadequate., for our relationship with the Father is not just like Jesus’ relationship with the Father; it is an actual, if created, participation in that relationship (*Our Father, Our Mother: Mary and the Faces of God*, [Steubenville, OH: Franciscan University Press, 1990], 55). The doctrine of deification is almost forgotten by western Christians, and its absence has been filled by the pantheistically flavored “god(dess) within” of feminism.
19. The New Testament is also aware of the dangers of masculinity. The Pharisees, whose name means separatists, emphasized the external codes of holiness, that separated them from pagans and Jews who did no observe the law, but neglected the interior code of holiness.
22. See *Rahner, Greek Myths and Christian Mystery*, 110-112.
23. Carl-Martin Edsman, “le baptême de feu signifiera une purification et une consécration; le rite d’initiation donnant droit à la participation au mystère céleste, de même que le baptême d’eau est la condition requise pour assister a mystère terrestre” (*Le Baptême de feu* [Leipzig, Alfred F. Lorenz, 1940], 135).
25. Michael Novak writes: “Religions are built upon *ascesis*, a world that derives from the disciplines Greek athletes imposed upon themselves to gives their wills and instincts command of their bodies; the word was borrowed by Christian monks and hermits. It signifies the development of character through patterns of self-denial, repetition, and experiment” (*The Joy of Sports: End Zones, Bases, Baskets, Balls, and the Consecration of the American Spirit*, rev. ed. [Lanham, Md.: Madison Books, 1994], 29.
28. Colgrave writes: “[T]hey sought to win the martyr’s crown by extreme asceticism. In a seventh-century Irish homily, the writer describes three types of martyrdom: white martyrdom, which implies abandoning everything for God’s sake; blue martyrdom, freeing oneself from evil desires by means of fasting and labor; and red martyrdom, enduring death for Christ’s sake” (Two Lives of Saint Cuthbert: A Life by an Anonymous Monk of Lindisfarne and Bede’s Prose Life, ed. and trans. by Bertram Colgrave [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985], 315.)
30. Ibid., 69.
32. Ibid., 20.
33. Ibid., 20-21.
34. Ibid., 22.
35. Two Lives of Saint Cuthbert, 98.
37. “At cum ibidem aliquandiu solitarium cum hoste invisibili orando ac ieiunando certeret, tandem maiores presumens, longinquorem ac remoto rem ab hominibus locum certaminis petit.” “But when he had fought there in solitude for some time with the invisible enemy, by prayer and fasting, he sought a place of combat farther and more removed from mankind, aiming at greater things” (Two Lives, 214, 215).
38. “heremeticae conversationis agonem” (Two Lives, 266).
40. Monastic profession was regarded as “an irrevocable engagement, making the conversio a second baptism, a baptism of repentance, which, differing from the first, remits sin in virtue of the labour of mortification of which it is the beginning” (Leclercq et al, The Spirituality of the Middle Ages, 182). See also Malone, Monk, 121.
41. Malone, Monk, 126.
45. Ibid.
46. Ibid., 55.
47. Ibid., p. 95.
49. Ibid., 62.
52. *Beowulf*, 183.
53. Ibid., 39.
54. Ibid., 111.
55. Ibid., 183.
56. Ibid., 185.
63. Ibid., 95.
66. For a complete discussion of this topic see “Martyrdom and Monastic Life as a ‘Militia Spiritualis’” in Malone, *Monk*, 91-111.
67. The vow mentioned in the Rule of St. Benedict is obedience. Of the other two vows, Cuthbert Butler says “[s]ometimes these two vows have been added . . . but usually they have not been explicitly mentioned,” Benedictine Monachism: Studies in Benedictine Life and Rule (London: 1919), 123. The three vows became explicit around the twelfth century, but the basic pattern was far older. For Gregory the Great, “[h]umility, continence, and generosity replace pride, lechery, and avarice,” Carole Straw, *Gregory the Great: Perfection in Imperfection* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1988), 196.
70. *Beowulf*, 117.
71. Ibid., 123.
72. Ibid., 153.
74. *Beowulf*, 91.
75. It may have meant simply *to die* in a pagan context, but in the *Pidreks saga*, Heimir (Hama) enters a monastery.
77. Ibid., 153.
78. Ibid., 155.
80. Rodney Stark believes that a majority of Christian converts were women. In part, conversion may have been easier for women. Men had public religious duties which were hard to evade. But the modern suspicion that early Christianity was predominantly feminine appears to be largely a presumption that things were as they are now. Stark points to the conversion patterns for “new religious movements in recent times,” but these may be a result of the very feminization I examine (*The Rise of Christianity: A Sociologist Reconsiders History* [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996], 100).

86. Ibid., 187.
87. John Bugge, *Virginitas: An Essay in the History of a Medieval Idea* (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1975). Bugge collects useful material, but his analysis is flawed by his tendency to see any trace of dualism or exaltation of virginity as “gnostic.” The New Testament, despite its anti-gnosticism, contains a form of dualism and exalts virginity. The Fathers used all their rhetorical powers to praise virginity, because marriage has its obvious attractions, and part of the rhetorical strategy was to appeal to the Platonism that was the common atmosphere of the spirituality of antiquity. The Fathers adopted Platonic language without adopting all the presuppositions of that language.
90. The process started in monasticism, John Climacus wrote “I have watched impure souls mad for physical love but turning what they knew of such love into a reason for penance and transferring that same capacity for love to the Lord.” Quoted by Brown, *The Body and Society*, 238.
6 The Foundations of Feminization

1. Despite the prominence of bridal mysticism in medieval and post-medieval spirituality, no one has done a full-scale study. See the article by Pierre Adnes, “Mariage mystique,” in *Dictionnaire de spiritualité, ascétique, et mystique, doctrine et histoire*, vol. 9, (Paris: G. Beauchesne et ses fils, 1937-1995), col. 388-408.


4. Ibid., 86.


7. Caroline Walker Bynum observes “The male writer who saw his soul as a bride of God or his religious role as womanly submission and humility was conscious of using an image of reversal. He sought reversal because reversal and renunciation were at the heart of a religion whose dominant symbol is the cross—life achieved through death” (“... And Woman His Humanity,” in *Gender and Religion: On The Complexity of Symbols*, ed. Caroline Walker Bynum, Steven Harrell, Paula Richman [Boston: Beacon Press, 1986], 273).


9. Ibid., 38.

10. Ibid., 53.

11. Denys Turner sees “pagan neo-Platonism” (*Eros and Allegory: Medieval Exegesis of the Song of Songs*. [Kalamazoo, Michigan: Cistercian Publications, 1995], 32). Eugene S. Miao also sees Platonism, and points to “the lamentable part played by the mystical interpretation of the Canticle of Canticles in assisting the identification of the Eros motif with the Christian idea of Agape” (*St. John of the Cross: The Imagery of Eros* (Madrid: Playor, 1973), 51. Maio follows Anders Nygen (*Eros and Agape* ) in finding all human love for God unChristian, but this is bizarre. A feminized Eros is what is objectionable; the Eros (for such it is, if eros is a love for something which a person is not and therefore has not) of friendship, brotherhood, and comradeship between man and Jesus is held up as a model in the Gospel.


17. Barbara Newman, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval*


20. Valerie M. Lagorio, “The Continental Women Mystics of the Middle Ages: An Assessment,” in Roots of the Modern Christian Tradition, 81. Leclercq et al concur, “It was chiefly among women . . . that the Brautmystik was received with fervor” (Spirituality of the Middle Ages, 373).

21. Birgitta explains: “One should know that this most humble handmaid of God never presumed to call herself or have herself called the bride of Christ, or his channel, because of vainglory or transitory honor any temporal advantage, but at the instruction of Christ and of blessed Mary, his most worthy mother, who both called her so” (Birgitta of Sweden: Life and Selected Revelations, ed. Marguerite Tjader Harris, trans. Albert Ryle Kezel [New York: Paulist Press, 1990], 71).

22. Leclercq et al., Spirituality, 374.


24. Ibid., 95.


26. Bridal mysticism is ubiquitous in medieval and post-medieval mystics. In Beatrice of Nazareth it is explicitly erotic and dominant. At her profession, “she sweetly rested in the arms of her spouse” (Life, 100). Christ “pressed her soul wholly to himself in the sweetest embrace” (Life, 195). She receives communion “as if she were mad with excessive desire” (Life, 225).


28. Ibid., 135.

29. Ibid., 150.

30. Ibid., 122.

31. Ibid., 96.


33. Ibid., 17.

34. Ibid., 19.

35. Ibid., 36.

36. Ibid., 98.

37. Ibid., 231.
38. Ibid., 98.
39. Ibid., 242, 253.
40. Ibid., 343.
41. For a study of the use of the bridal metaphor by these two Carmelites, see Elizabeth Teresa Howe, Mystical Imagery: Santa Teresa de Jesús and San Juan de la Cruz (New York: Peter Lang, 1987), esp. 161-169. For both saints, “spiritual marriage symbolizes the culmination of the mystic’s quest” (Ibid., 168). The conformity to God is not the Scriptural image of being conformed to the Son, but in John of the Cross’s phrase, “Amada en el Amado transformada.”

42. Turner, Eros and Agape, 25.
43. David Herlihy writes: “There is...a body of scattered but consistent comment which indicates that between the early and late Middle Ages, women had gained a superiority over men in life expectancy” (“Life Expectancies for Women in Medieval Society” in The Role of Women in the Middle Ages, ed. Rosemarie Morewedge [Albany: State University of New York, 1975], 11). The climate had improved in the high Middle Ages, when grain could even be grown in Iceland, and improved food supplies may have helped women more than men, because pregnancy made women more susceptible to the consequences of malnutrition.


46. Southern, Western Society, 314.
48. “Dominus a nobis uxores abstuli, dyabolus autem nobis procurat sorores” (quoted by Grundmann, Bewegungen, 262, f. 149). Somehow this quote was omitted from the English translation, Religious Movements.
49. The decision reads “prohibemus ne aliquis fratrum nostrorum de cetero laboret vel procuret, ut cura vel custodia monialum seu quarumlibet aliarum mulierum nostris fratribus committantur” (we prohibit either to labor or to seek out that the care or custody of nuns or of any other women be committed to our brothers) (quoted by Roger De Ganck, Beatrice of Nazareth in Her Context [Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1991], 21, note 89).

50. Grundmann says of Dominic: “On his deathbed, in his last conversations on the order, he pressingly warned his brethren against association with women, particularly with young women. Was he only warning against the moral attitude of individual friars? Is it possible that the founder, preoccupied with questions about the future of his order in these last utterances, had been discussing whether the order should incor-
porate further women’s communities, placing friars to oversee and supply them, withdrawing from the order’s primary duty of preaching?” (Religious Movements, 94-95).

51. According to Grundmann, “The women themselves sought to join the large orders, and the curia was concerned to make this possible; the orders, however, fought it, trying by all means available to avoid the obligation of receiving and administering women’s communities” (Religious Movements, 90).

52. Grundmann, Religious Movements, 98.

53. Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M. Bell state: “Among Benedictines, however, very few women were celebrated as saintly. Of the 134 Benedictine saints in our sample, 106 died in the eleventh and twelfth century, and of this latter figure only 11 percent were women” (Saints and Society: Christendom, 1000-1700 [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977], 223).

54. Weinstein and Bell, Saints, 223.


56. André Vauchez has analyzed the processes for canonization and the canonizations in the Latin church. His figures show a shift from the twelfth to the fourteenth century in the ratio of lay men to lay women. From 1198 to 1431, 55.5 per cent of the canonization of lay Christian were of women, and 44.5 of men. However, “parmi les procès de canonisation de saints laïcs, 50% au XIIIe siècle concernent des femmes contre 71.4% au cours de la période ultérieure. Après 1305, les laïcs dont la sainteté est reconnue par l’Eglise appartiennent deux fois sur trois au sexe faible (among the processes of canonization for lay saints, 50% in the thirteenth century concerned women as opposed to 71.4% during the course of the later period. After 1395 the saints whose sanctity was recognized by the Church belonged two out of three times to the weaker sex).” Vauchez continues that the Curia canonized women recommended by the mendicant orders, and that “La sainteté laïque masculine. . . disparait complètement de l’horizon de la Curie” (Lay masculine sanctity disappeared completely from the horizon of the Curia) (La Sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du moyen age [Rome: Ecole Française de Rome: 1981], 317.

57. Anne K. Warren, “English anchoritism was already biased toward women in the twelfth century. It became sharply female in orientation in the thirteenth century” (Anchorites and Their Patrons in Medieval England [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985], 20). Female anchorites were always more common than male anchorites in England, although Warren notes that the proportion of men increased toward the Reformation.


60. Berthold von Regensburg preached: “Ir frouwen, ir sit barmherzic unde gët
gerner zuo kirchen danne die man unde sprechet iuwer gebete gerner danne die man unde gêt zu predigen gerner danne die man” (*Predigten*, Vol. 1, ed. Franz Pfeiffer [Vienna: Wilhelm Braumüller, 1862], 41). In another sermon, Berthold continues in the same vein, and says that women are “erbaumherziger, danne die man und betet gerner, mit venie, mit danne die man, mit kirchgengen, mit riuwe, mit ûf stên, mit salter lesen, mit vigilie. Mit maniger guottæte sît ir bezzer (More merciful than men and more willing to pray with prostrations than men, with visits to church, with quiet, with standing, with reading the Psalter, with vigils. With many good deeds are you better) (*Predigten*, Vol. 2, 141).


62. Ibid., 242.


7 Feminized Christianity


5. Ibid., 55-56.


9. Ibid., p. 22.
12. Amanda Porterfield writes: “Puritans defined grace as a kind of intercourse between God and the saint that signified the saint's espousal to God and thereby her salvation, and they sometimes pictured this intercourse in a way that aroused erotic feelings that could be interpreted as the stirrings of grace” (*Female Piety in Puritan New England: The Emergence of Religious Humanism* [New York: Oxford University Press, 1992], 14).
the suspicion of the anti-Gnostic propagandists among the Fathers. Christians seem unable
to praise marriage without denigrating virginity (the fault of Luther) or to praise virginity
without denigrating marriage. Since most Christians marry, and since almost all Christians
have several years in which they must practice chastity before marriage, everyone has a
chance to feel he is living in an impossible spiritual state.

27. Juan González Arintero, The Song of Songs: A Mystical Exposition, with a preface
by Alberto Colunga, trans. James Valender and Jose L. Morales (Rockford Il: Tan Books,

28. Ibid., 8.

29. Ibid., 22.

30. See Karl Barth, above, xxx.


32. Ibid., 94. Hauke, it must be admitted, says this in the context of women's
greater integration of personality, a characterization of femininity that is closer to the

33. Ibid., 300.

34. Ron Hansen has used this eroticized spirituality as the basis for his novel, Mariette in Ecstasy (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, Harper Perennial, 1991). Mariette, a
(fraudulent?) stigmatist, moves in a conventual world of pain and sexuality. She is taught
"We know from Church teaching that the soul has no true pleasure but in love. And we
know from our experience that extreme bliss can only come from extreme passion" (ibid.,
60). The nuns enact a play based on the Songs of Songs (ibid., 82-85). After she is stigmatized,
her confessor wonders "And why are there so many women and so few men?" who
are stigmatists (ibid., 127). Mariette dreams (?) she is being raped (by whom? the devil?)
(ibid., 145). Mariette dreams of talking with Christ, and she sleeps with him: "And I
share in him as if he's inside me. And he is" (ibid., 168). All this is only a slight distor-
tion of the eroticized spirituality held up as a model for sanctity from the Middle Ages
to the present.

35. Barbara Newman, From Virile Woman to Woman Christ: Studies in Medieval
also observes: "religious males had a problem. If the God with whom they wished to unite
was spoken of in male language, it was hard to use the metaphor of sexual union unless they
saw themselves as female" (Bynum, Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High
Middle Ages [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982], 161) which some of them did:
"We also have many examples of monks describing themselves or their souls as the bride of
Christ" (Bynum, Jesus as Mother, 161).

36. Brenda E. Basher speculates about the fundamentalist churches she studied:
"both the emphasis on religious experiences in the female enclaves and the dearth of re-
ligious experiences in overall congregational life may be an entailment of each group's
gender habits with its theological and social ideals rather than a consequence of gend-
er-based social power conflicts. The male-imaged deity and heterosexual norms cre-
ate an environment in which women who seek religious experience are actually per-
foming their gender, while men perform theirs by declining to pursue such conduct"
(Godly Women: Fundamentalism and Female Power [New Brunswick, New Jersey,
Basher assumes, as the fundamentalists may also assume, that "religious experience" is innately erotic, and therefore for men it would have homosexual overtones, because the Deity is male.


39. Ibid., 117.

40. Ibid.


42. Ibid., 43.


44. Ibid.


48. Ibid., 168.


50. Ibid., 47.


52. Ibid., 40.

53. Ibid., 62.

54. Ibid., 67.

55. Ibid., 82.

56. José de Vinck, *Revelations of Women Mystics From the Middle Ages to Modern Times* (New York: Alba House, 1985), 87-88

57. Ibid., 160.

58. Ibid., 165.


60. Liege was dominated by feminine spirituality. Miri Rubin observes "The men witnessed the spirituality of their female neighbors or charges and compared it with their own; some extraordinary friendships were struck between monks and beguines, and this mutual fascination was to develop further when the mendicant and beguine communities were to meet in the thirteenth century" ([*Corpus Christi: The Eucharist in Late Medieval Culture*](https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/corpus-christi/The-Eucharist-in-Late-Medieval-Culture), 167.

62. Miri Rubin writes: “narratives of encounter with a child in the host dominated the fantasies of women, especially by those attached to the eucharist. These could be violent and pathetic like Jane Mary of Maillé’s (d. 1414) vision of a wounded child elevated in the host. It could also be deeply loving: Agnes of Montepulciano (d. 1317) and Margaret of Faenza (d. 1330) were each so intoxicated with the baby they saw they refused to give it up, and Ida of Louvain played with the child revealed to her” (*Corpus Christi*, 344).

63. Of St. Catherine of Genoa it was said in the *Spiritual Dialogues*, “No priest or friar objected to this need, the daily reception of the Blessed Sacrament, for such was the will of God” (Catherine of Genoa, *Purgation and Purgatory, the Spiritual Dialogue*, trans. Serge Hughes [New York: Paulist Press, 1979], 110).


67. Jean Leclercq, “It was, then, among the Béguines of the thirteenth century... that the first evidence of the Wesenmystik is found” (*The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*, trans. the Benedictines of Holmes Eden Abbey [1961. London, Burns and Oates, 1968], 377).

68. Leclercq, *Spirituality*, 357. These religious women also showed a contempt for the hierarchy and an indifference to the sacraments, as well as moral license.


73. Ibid., 109.


75. Ibid., 61.

76. Ibid., 69.


80. Ibid., 97-113.
81. Ibid., 99.
82. Ibid., 111.
83. Moller, “Sex Composition” 146.
85. Ibid., 196.
86. Marina Warner, “Blood and Tears,” New Yorker 72:7 (8 April 1996): 69. E. Michael Jones, editor of Fidelity, has made a career of exposing false revelations, or at least ones he has decided are false. Women figure prominently in them.
87. Ibid., 65.
89. Ibid., 170-171.
90. Ibid., 139.
93. Terman and Miles, Sex and Personality, 117.
95. Ibid., 160. Nesbitt notes that “Conservative Protestant denominations have been less affected by a declining supply of young men.” (Ibid., 104).
96. In Hauke’s critique of feminist theology in God or Goddess, it is clear that women are irked by the identification of women and obedience, and the consequent special duty of women to obey to avoid being “unnatural,” that is, unfeminine. Feminists therefore often reject both obedience and the concept of a binding revelation.
98. Ibid., 32.
99. Ibid., 37.
100. Ibid., 39.
101. Ibid., 40.

8 Countercurrents

2. Ibid., 134.
3. Ibid.
4. Ibid., 135.
5. Ibid.
6. Simone Roison writes: “C’est à la Vierge que va l’affection sensible des moines comme l’amour ardent des moniales tend vers le Christ eucharistique, l’Époux céleste” (It is to the Virgin that the devotion of the senses of the monks was directed as the ardent love of the nuns tended to the Eucharistic Christ, the heavenly Bridegroom) (Simone Roisin, L’Hagiographie cistercienne dans le diocèse de Liège au XIIIe siècle. [Louvain: Bibliothèque de l’Université, 1947], 115).
9. Ibid., 289.
10. Graef quotes Bernadine of Siena: “one Hebrew woman invaded the house of the eternal King; one girl, I do not know by what caresses, pledge or violence, seduced, deceived and, if I may say so, wounded and enraptured the divine heart and ensnared the Wisdom of God” (Mary, Vol. 1, 317).
12. Ibid., 297.
13. Graef again quotes Bernadine of Siena that Mary “has added certain perfections to the Maker of the universe” (Mary, Vol. 1, 317).
15. Quoted, Ibid., 117.
20. Quoted by Harvey, Ignatius, 192.
21. Ignatius wrote of himself: “Up to the age of twenty-six, he was a man given to the vanities of the world; and what he enjoyed most was warlike sport, with a great and foolish desire to win fame” (Autobiography, in Ignatius of Loyola: Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works, ed. George E. Ganss [New York: Paulist Press, 1991], 68).
23. Ibid., 74.
24. Ignatius uses the image in such passages as “in Christ the Lord, the bridegroom, and in His spouse the Church” (Exercises, 160).
25. Ignatius, Exercises, 145. Ignatius also compares Satan to “a woman” because he “is a weakling before a show of strength, and a tyrant if he has his will” (Exercises, 145).
26. Ibid., 43.
27. Ibid., 44.
28. Ibid., 60.
29. Quoted by Harvey, Ignatius, 149.
32. In a foreshadowing of later conflicts, “when the master-general of the Dominican Order imposed the Regola dei fratelli e delle sorelle della penitenzia di S. Dominico on the confraternities affiliated with the Dominicans, thereby making the admission of members subject to the authorization of the Dominicans, the male members withdrew. And is it not the case that the only noteworthy members of these pious congregations in the fourteenth century were women, mantellate like St. Catherine of Siena and Maria of Venice?” (Vauchez, Laity, 115).
33. Vauchez, Laity, 123.
34. “Women were excluded from them for obvious reasons” (Ibid., 123).
37. Ibid., 201-202.
38. Ibid., 202.
41. Christine E. Gudorf describes the situation of the Church at the beginning of Vatican II: “as the Church lost ground to liberalism in attempting to retain its former niche in the world, it shifted the grounds of religion’s defense from the public political sphere to the private domestic sphere. This reinforced religion’s feminine image by suggesting that there was indeed a special connection between religion and the feminine domestic sphere” (“Renewal or Repatriarchalization: Responses of the Roman Catholic Church to the Feminization of Religion,” Horizons 10 [1982]: 234).
42. Ibid., 251.
52. Herbert Moller, “Sex Composition and Correlated Cultural Patterns of Colonial America,” *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd series, 2 (1945): 152.
57. Ibid., 53. Terry D. Bihlartz observed that in the early nineteenth century “revivalist Methodist and belatedly evangelistic Presbyterian congregations slowed the feminization process of Baltimore’s religious institutions” (*Urban Religion and the Second Great Awakening: Church and Society in Early National Baltimore* [Rutherford, New Jersey: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1986], 97).
58. Jonathan Edwards had delivered a sermon on the same theme in the earlier part of the century: “It is surprising and almost amazing to hear what a swift pass the nation has got to in the present day, and what a swift progress Deism and heresies have lately made in this nation. Those that deny all revealed religion, that deny Scripture to be the word of God, that deny all the gospel, deny that Christ was anything but
a mean cheat, and deny all that is said about the way of salvation by him, they are vastly multiplied as of late years, yea, even as to threaten to swallow up the nation, and to root the very name of Christianity out of it; they are become the very fashionable sort of men (quoted by Perry Miller, “Jonathan Edward’s Sociology of the Great Awakening,” *New England Quarterly* 21 (1948): 54-55).

60. Ibid., 170.

61. Kling writes: “The large percentage of married men converted and then admitted to Church membership, either simultaneously with their wives or following their wives’ conversion, suggests that for many males, conversion came at the behest of their spouses” (*A Field of Divine Wonders*, 217).


66. Ibid., 16.

68. Ibid., 204.


71. Quoted by Laura Fasick, “Charles Kingsley’s Scientific Treatment of Gender,” in *Muscular Christianity*, 93.


73. Ibid., 17-26.


75. Bederman summarizes: “According to Census figures, in 1906 the Protestant churches, combined, had been 39.5 percent male. By 1926, the proportion had grown 6.3 percent to 41.8 percent male. Some denominations...has gained even more new men. For example, the proportion of men in Congregational churches grew by 10.9 percent. In the Northern Presbyterian (U. S. A.) churches, male membership was up by 11.2 percent. The proportion of Episcopalian men grew by a whopping 20.8 per-
cent” (“Men and Religion,” 454). Indeed, reports in 1925 were that “male converts had nearly equaled female converts during the past several years” (ibid., 455) although the previous state of the church persisted: “Protestant churches still had more women than men.” (ibid., 454).

77. Ibid., 69.
78. Ibid., 40-41.
79. Ibid., 42-43.
80. Ibid., 121.
81. Ibid., 179. Other writers have pointed to this dichotomy as a source of masculine discomfort with religion. Martin W. Pable writes: “Unfortunately, most Christian men I know don’t think their job has anything to do with their spiritual life” and quotes Pope Paul VI: “one of the greatest evils of our time is the separation of religion from the rest of life” (A Man and His God [Notre Dame: Ave Maria Press, 1988], 59).
82. Ibid., 179.
83. Ibid., 180.
85. Ibid., 41.
86. Ibid., 88.
87. Margaret Lamberts Bendroth, Fundamentalism and Gender:1875 to the Present (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 64.
88. Bendroth notes that by the 1940s “the overrepresentation of women in the movement’s rank and file visibly contradicted the claim that orthodoxy was a masculine reserve, setting off fears of feminization that had been part of the fundamentalist ethos since its earliest stages” (Fundamentalism, 90).
89. Bendroth, Fundamentalism, 19.
91. Ibid., 185.
92. Pope John Paul II likes the substance of Saint Louis Marie Grignon de Montfort’s Treatise of True Devotion to the Blessed Virgin, but admits that the book “can be a bit disconcerting, given its rather florid and baroque style” (Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordination [New York: Doubleday, 1996], 29).

9 Masculinity as Religion: Transcendence and Nihilism

1. Gail Bederman writes of the influence of the popular press of Theodore Roosevelt’s time: “middle-class constructions of male power would become firmly based on the violence and sexuality of his journalistic version of primitive masculinity” (Man-


3. Ibid., 3, 175.


7. For an analysis of Lawrence’s sacralization of sexuality, see Pickstone, *Divinity of Sex*, 62-65.

8. Elliot J. Gorn writes: “Sports taught manliness in a violent world. All that was feminine, sentimental, or romantic - and many late nineteenth-century writers worried aloud that America had become ‘womanized’ - was expunged on athletic fields of battle” (*The Manly Art: Bare-Knuckle Prize Fighting in America* [Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986], 189).


11. Ibid., 94.


16. Ibid.


19. Ibid., 63.

23. Quoted Ibid., 131.
25. Brian W. W. Anderson asked Christian athletes whether they had any psychological high or any sense of God’s presence when they played, “And in every interview the answer was the same, a categorical ‘no’; sports can be fun and a very significant part of their lives but it is more like work than religion” (“The Emergence of Born-Again Sport,” in *Religion and Sport*, 209).
26. Alan M. Klein analyzes this reaction: “the weakness that lives at the core of so many bodybuilders, and the vulnerability they struggle to overcome, is responsible for the elaboration of a lifestyle that brooks no weakness or vulnerability” (*Little Big Men: Bodybuilding Subculture and Gender Construction* [Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993], 19).
29. The resemblances between bodybuilding and fascism that Klein detects (“Body, Fascist Imagery, and Masculinity” in *Little Big Men*, 253-264) are the sense of powerlessness and victimization that leads to the pursuit of power and hardness as means of protection.
32. Ibid., 190.
34. Ibid., 12.
35. Ibid., 11.
36. Ibid., 13.
37. Ibid., 21.
38. Ibid., 25.
39. Ibid., 18-20.
40. Ibid., 54.
41. Ibid., 67.
42. Ibid., 175.
43. Ibid., 176.
44. Ibid.
45. Ibid., 178.
46. Serge Hutin notes: “on peut dire sans paradoxe que la Franc-Maçonnerie
modern a repris et continué l’ésotérisme des Rose-Croix, reprenant leurs symboles hermétiques les plus typiques, comme la pélican, le phénix qui renait de ses cendres, l’aigle bicéphale, etc.” (one can say without paradox that modern Freemasonry has picked up and continued the esotericism of the Rosicrucians, taking up its very typical hermetic symbols, such as the pelican, the phoenix which is reborn from its own ashes, the two-headed eagle, etc.) (Les Société’s secrètes [Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1970], 56; for the involvement of the hermeticist Robert Fludd in the rise of Freemasonry, see ibid., 63).

47. J. N. Casavis claims in The Greek Origins of Freemasonry (New York: The Square Press, 1955) “Modern Masonry is historically based upon the Ancient Greek Mysteries” and that “Even at such a late date as the year 1583 A. D., Hermes was claimed as the founder of Freemasonry, for such he is taken and accepted in the Old Masonic manuscript No. One of the Grand Lodge of England, and in all the other old documents of the order” (Greek Origins, 34). A direct historical connection with antiquity is doubtful, but a strong influence through the revival of hermeticism in the Renaissance looks likely.


49. Mark C. Carnes writes: “The Voice of Masonry added that because churches were attended mostly by women, they should be given a greater share of church governance. Men, on the other hand, should rest content with their exclusive dominion over the religion of the lodge” (Secret Ritual and Manhood in Early America [New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989], 76).

50. Carnes: “In the early twentieth century, lodges outnumbered churches in all large cities” (Secret Ritual 89).

51. Carnes: “The founders of fraternal groups emphasized ritual from the outset and added other activities almost by chance” (Secret Ritual, 9).

52. See Carnes, Secret Ritual, 94-107.

53. Case tries to answer the question “Why do many men prefer the lodge to the church?” but ignores the ritual aspects, concentrating on the social advantages of mutual aid and recreation. See “Men and the Lodge” in The Masculine in Religion, 98-99.

54. Carnes, Secret Ritual, 57.

55. Ibid., 56-57.

56. Ibid., 72.

57. Michael Rosenthal claims: “For Scouting was from the very beginning conceived as a remedy to Britain’s moral, physical, and military weakness - conditions that the Boer war seemed to announce - especially to Tory politicians, social imperialists, and military leaders - were threatening the Empire (The Character Factory: Baden-Powell and the Origins of the Boy Scout Movement [London: Collins, 1986], 3).

65. Ibid., 22.
66. Ibid., 37-38.
67. Gibson, “the highest form of friendship is the brotherhood of war” (Warrior Dreams, 138).
68. Ibid., 179.
69. Ibid., 178.
70. Ibid., 306.
71. Ibid., 308.
72. Gibson: “No matter how secular the New Age warrior may appear with his high-tech weapons and tremendous ‘efficient’ kills, he is essentially a religious figure” (Warrior Dreams, 102-103). An NRA official explained to a reporter, “You would get a far better understanding if you approached us as if you were approaching one of the great religions of the world” (Warrior Dreams, 252). Soldiers of Fortune magazine provides men with “religious transcendence” (Warrior Dreams, 167). Paramilitarism seeks to transform men, to help them transcend the secular, ordinary world into a sacred realm above the merely natural.
75. Quoted in Paul Booker, The Faces of Fraternalism: Nazi Germany, Fascist Italy, and Imperial Japan (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991) 62. Theodore Roosevelt puts it less elegantly: “The woman who, whether from cowardice, from selfishness, from having a false and vacuous ideal shirks her duty as wife and mother, earns the right to our contempt, just as does the man who, from any motive, fears to do his duty in battle when his country calls him” (quoted by Michael C. C. Adams, The Great Adventure: Male Desire and the Coming of World War I [Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1990], 7).
76. William Broyles, Jr. Brothers in Arms: A Journey from War to Peace (New York: Knopf, 1986), 201. Roy Raphael quotes a Stan B.: “I now almost regret that I didn’t serve overseas during the Vietnam War. I think that there must be some parallel that
war is to men what childbirth is to women. I’ve heard from buddies of mine who are veterans, that there’s no intensity of human emotion greater than being under fire” (The Men from the Boys: Rites of Passage in Male America [Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1988], 150).

77. Adrian Caesar feels this implication in Owen: “For he not only criticised warfare, he celebrated, even glorified it because it is the site of suffering and of love. In his work, war is seen as appalling, but it is this very quality which engenders the loving sacrifice of the men” (Taking It Like a Man: Suffering, Sexuality, and the War Poets [Manchester: Manchester University Press: 1993], 167).


79. Samuel Hynes points out that this is not a literary conceit: “there are moments in war when men become different men, who can do things that in their peacetime lives they would call monstrous and inhuman. We don’t like to believe this – that men can change their essential nature—but it must be true, or there would be no atrocities. But there are atrocities, in every age, in every war” (The Soldiers’ Tale: Bearing Witness to Modern War [New York: Viking Penguin, 1997], 10).

81. Ibid., 255.
82. Ibid.
83. Ibid., 317.
84. Ibid., 220.
85. Ibid., 118.
86. Ibid., 109.
87. It was designed by Fritz Erler for the German War Loan of 1917. It is reproduced in George L. Mosse, Fallen Soldiers: Reshaping the Memory of the World Wars (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), 134.
89. George L. Mosse, Fallen Soldiers, 35.
92. Ibid., 357.
94. The danger and excitement of sports can also break down the barriers be-
tween men. Arnold R. Beisser observes “Perhaps some mitigation is to be found in sports and athletics. A football player who is a linebacker can encouragingly pat his lineman on the behind in full view of a hundred thousand people. Baseball players hug each other and may even kiss each other (The Madness in Sports: Psychosocial Observations on Sports [New York: Appleton-Century Crofts, 1967], 196). Michael Novak also sees this happening: “Sports brings out in every ideal team a form of gentleness and tenderness so intense that it is no misnomer to call it love; and coaches generally speak to their supposed macho males like golden-tongued preachers of love, brotherhood, comradeship. Tears, burning throats, and raw love of male for male are not unknown among athletes in the heat of preparation...and in the solemn battle” (The Joy of Sports, 46).

97. Leo Steinberg, in The Sexuality of Christ in Renaissance Art and Modern Oblivion (London: Faber and Faber Limited, 1984) examines the portrayals of the sexuality of Christ. The genitals are often the central point of a Madonna and Child, and even in the Crucifixion the blood, contrary to gravity, ran down from the side to the genitals to emphasize the connection between maleness and sacrifice.
98. I believe that it is this feeling that military men refer to when they talk about group cohesiveness and why they say that homosexuals in a combat unit ruin it.
101. Mosse, Fallen Soldiers, 55.
102. Mussolini, although he preferred Futurism, turned against it and made Social Realism the official art of the state, because it was accessible to the masses. Similar processes of work in other totalitarian regimes strangled the avant-garde. See Igor Golomstock’s Totalitarian Art in the Soviet Union, the Third Reich, Fascist Italy and the People’s Republic of China, trans. Robert Chandler (IconEditions. New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1990).
105. Barbara Ehrenreich, “Forward” to Klaus Theweleit’s Male Fantasies Vol. 1, Women Floods Bodies History, xiii.
106. Ibid.
107. Raphael: “The frustrations of unfulfilled masculinity are, I fear, potentially dangerous. What if our male anxiety gets projected onto the political arena, where an overcompensation for personal inadequacy can easily get transformed into militaristic jingoism? In the wake of World War I, the severe emasculation of German males—militarily, economically, socially—provided fertile ground for pathological politics” (The Men from The Boys, 187).

108. Alfred Bäumler at the beginning of the Nazi era wrote: “Mann steht daneben Mann, Säule neben Säule, das ist die Schlachtreibe, das ist der Tempel, das ist das Heiligtum, das ist der Staat” (Männerbund und Wissenschaft [Berlin: Junker und Dünnhaupt Verlag, 1934], 39). This Männerbund with its male eros (which sometimes became openly homosexual) was the model for the SA (destroyed in the Röhm purge), and was suppressed by the Nazis in favor of a mass political movement (see Mosse, Crisis of German Ideology: Intellectual Origins of the Third Reich [New York: Schocken Books, 1981], 309). However, anxiety about masculinity contributed to the rise of Nazism. Elisabeth Badinter says: “the anxiety of German and Austrian men over their identity was not unrelated to the rise of Nazism and more generally to European fascism. Hitler’s accession to power resonated unconsciously with the promise that manliness would be restored” (XY: On Masculine Identity, trans. Lydia Davis [New York: Columbia University Press, 1995], 17).


110. This was the warning that Pope John Paul II addressed in his encyclical Veritatis Splendor to moral theologians who were undermining the absolute, objective nature of moral obligations. The Pope had personally experienced the results of such relativism in the Nazi occupation of Poland.

111. Hermann Rauschning was an associate of Hitler who turned against him and fled to the United States and wrote The Revolution of Nihilism: Warning to the West (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1939). He warned that the Nazis espoused “the utter destruction of all traditional spiritual standards, utter nihilism” (Revolution, xii), that even its racist philosophy was but a front for the adoration of pure power and activity without any purpose except further activity.

10 The Future of Men in the Church

5. Ibid., 67.
6. Ibid., 69.
7. Ceslaus Spicq discusses this passage: “Touché de cette ferveur, le Maître répond alors le mot même de Pierre, (v. 17). Vraiment? Tu m’aimes encore? Je puis croire que tu es un ami véritable? Je puis avoir confiance en ta parole et en ton cœur?” (Touched by such fervor, the Master replies with the same word of Peter, ‘Do you love (philesi) me?’ Truly? You still love me? Can I believe that you are a true friend? Can I have confidence in your word and in your heart?) (Agape dans le nouveau testament: Analyse des textes [Paris: Librairie Lecoffre, 1959], 234). Many commentators see Jesus’ use of “friends” to be simply synonymous with people or neighbors, and some explicitly place the bridal relationship higher. Spicq points out that in John friendship is the most intimate type of love between the Father and the Son. The Son does what he sees the Father doing, “Il n’a pas de secret pour son Fils, qui est initié à ses pensées et ses intentions les plus cachées. L’amour de Dieu est ici un amour d’intimité, il rend compte de la confiance et des confidences du Père envers son Fils incarné qu’il traite en ami” (There is no secret from the Son, who is initiated into the most secret thoughts and intentions. The love of God is here a love of closeness, it takes account of the trust and the confidence of the Father toward the incarnate Son, whom he treats as a friend) (ibid., 220). Spicq points that this is exactly what philos is, “non un amour religieux et réfléchi de supérieur à inférieur, mais un abandon spontané entre deux êtres unis par une dilection réciproque qui les met à niveau” (Not a religious love and reflected from the superior to the inferior, but a spontaneous abandon between two beings united by a reciprocal affection (ibid., 220). Aquinas along the same line defines charity as the friendship of man for God (Summa Theologica, IIa-IIae, Q. 23, Art. 1).

8. Thomas More is perhaps the most accessible, but his sanctity consisted in a response to crisis. Martyrdom is a clear choice, but at present, in the West anyway, outright martyrdom is rarely a possibility. The modern religious martyrs of the West whose sanctity has been recognized either officially or unofficially displayed great masculine virtues, but they were all clerics: Maximilian Kolbe, Titus Brandsma, and the priest whose deeds are the subject of the heartbreaking Au Revoir Les Enfants.
Bibliography


Forrest, Tom. “Is the Church Attractive to Men?” Origins 17, no. 21 (November 5, 1987)
Bibliography


Harrison, James. “Warning: the Male Sex Role May Be Dangerous to Your


Hoge, Dean R., and David A. Roozen. “Research on Factors Influencing Church Commitment.” In Understanding Church Growth and Decline, 1950-


James, David C. *What Are They Saying About Masculine Spirituality?* New York: Paulist Press, 1996.


———. *Gift and Mystery: On the Fiftieth Anniversary of My Priestly Ordi-


Kaspar, Walter. “Church as communio” Communio vol. 13, no. 2 (Summer 1986): 100-17


Kristeva, Julia In the Beginning Was Love: Psychoanalysis and Love. Trans-
Bibliography


Macleod, David I. Building Character in the American Boy: The Boy Scouts,


McCartney, Bill. “God is Calling Us to a Higher Love,” in Go the Distance: The Making of a Promise Keeper, ed. John Trent. Colorado Springs,
Bibliography


Bibliography


Pearse, Edward. The Best Match: or the Souls Espousal to Christ, opened and approved. London, 1673.


Bibliography


Spicq, Ceslaus. Agape dans le nouveau testament: Analyse des textes. Paris:


Weisner, Merry? “Luther and Women: The Death of Two Marys.” In *Disciplines of Faith*, edited by Jim Obelkevich, Lyndal Roper, and Raphael Samuel.


A Note on the Author

Leon J. Podles earned his bachelor’s degree at Providence College and his doctorate in English at the University of Virginia. He later studied Old Icelandic at the University of Iceland. He has worked as a teacher and federal investigator and has written for numerous journals, including America, the American Spectator, Crisis, and the American Enterprise. He is a contributing editor of Touchstone. He is president of Crossland Foundation, serves on the board of BishopAccountability.org and is a Boy Scout leader. He is married and has six children.
This book was published in the Adobe PDF format by the Crossland Foundation.

For more information visit www.CrosslandFoundation.org